

# THE STATES assembled on Tuesday 27th February 2024, at 9.30 a.m. under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff, Robert James MacRae, Esquire.

His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor, Vice-Admiral Jeremy Paul Kyd, C.B.E. was present.

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Connétable Michael Keith Jackson of St. Brelade – excused attendance Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier Central – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.38 a.m.) Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.41 a.m.) Deputy Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf of St. Saviour – ill Deputy Mary Rose Scott of St. Brelade – ill

Prayers read by the Greffier of the States

# Standing Order 55A – remote participation

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams. The following Members attended remotely, either for all or part of the meeting –

Connétable Marcus O'Donnel Troy of St. Clement

## Tribute to the late Mr Simon Muir Brée, former member of the States

The Bailiff paid tribute to the late Mr. Simon Muir Brée, former Deputy of St. Clement. The States observed one minute's silence as a mark of respect.

## Subordinate enactments tabled

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Road Traffic (St. Helier) (Amendment No. 42) (Jersey) Order 2024. Minister for Infrastructure. R&O.3/2024.

Road Traffic (Trinity) (Amendment No. 12) (Jersey) Order 2024. *Minister for Infrastructure*.

R&O.4/2024.

Customs and Excise (Import and Export Control) (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Order 2024.

R&O.5/2024.

Minister for Justice and Home Affairs.

Mental Health (Miscellaneous Provisions and Prescribed Forms) (Amendment No. 3) R&O.6/2024. (Jersey) Order 2024. Minister for Health and Social Services. Wildlife (Areas of Special Protection – Amendment of Prohibited Activities) (Jersey) R&O.7/2024. Order 2024. Minister for the Environment. Road Traffic (St. Clement) (Jersey) Amendment Order 2024. R&O.8/2024. Minister for Infrastructure. Environment (2024 Animals and Fisheries Fees) (Jersey) Order 2024. R&O.9/2024. Minister for the Environment. **Documents presented** Draft Income Tax (Amendment - Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-P.6/2024. (P.6/2024): amendment. (P.6/2024 Amd.): Children's Rights Impact Assessment. Amd.Add. Presented: 13th February 2024, Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour. Ceasefire in Gaza (P.7/2024): amendment (P.7/2024 Amd) – Children's Rights Impact P.7/2024. Assessment. Amd.Add. Presented: 22nd February 2024, Minister for External Relations. Cabinet Office expenditure savings (P.8/2024): comments. P.8/2024. Presented: 22nd February 2024, Council of Ministers. Com. Cash payment at Government Sports facilities (P.10/2024) - Children's Rights Impact P.10/2024. Assessment. Add. Presented: 26th February 2024, Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter. Electronic Patient Record. R.21/2024. Presented: 8th February 2024, Comptroller and Auditor General. States of Jersey Law 2005: Delegation of Functions - Minister for Infrastructure -R.22/2024. Appointment of Assistant Minister. Presented: 9th February 2024, Minister for Infrastructure. Notice Under Article 29A(3) of the States of Jersey Law 2005: Changes to Ministerial R.23/2024. Offices. Presented: 13th February 2024, Chief Minister. Jersey Criminal Injuries Compensation Board – Annual Report 2023. R.24/2024. Presented: 14th February 2024, Minister for Justice and Home Affairs. States of Jersey Law 2005: Delegation of Functions – Minister for External Relations – R.25/2024. Appointment of Assistant Ministers. Presented: 16th February 2024, Minister for External Relations. Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority: Intended Re-appointment of Chair. R.26/2024.

Presented: 16th February 2024, Minister for Sustainable Economic Development.

Annual Report of findings 2023. R.27/2024.

Presented: 20th February 2024, Comptroller and Auditor General.

Fiscal Policy Panel – Re-appointment of Member. R.28/2024.

Presented: 21st February 2024, Minister for Treasury and Resources.

Director of Civil Aviation Annual Report 2023. R.29/2024.

Presented: 23rd February 2024, Minister for External Relations.

## **Notification of lodged propositions**

Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-(P.6/2024): amendment. Amd.

Lodged: 13th February 2024, Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour.

Ceasefire in Gaza (P.7/2024): amendment. P.7/2024.

Lodged: 22nd February 2024, *Minister for External Relations*. Amd. (re-issue).

(1c-issue).

Comptroller and Auditor General Board of Governance: Appointment of Member. P.9/2024.

Lodged: 23rd February 2024, Chief Minister.

Cash payment at Government Sports facilities. P.10/2024.

Lodged: 26th February 2024, Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and

St. Peter.

#### Withdrawal of lodged propositions

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposer of the following proposition lodged "au Greffe" had informed the Greffier of the States that it had been withdrawn –

P.75/2023.

Ethical Standards – States Members.

Lodged: 26th September 2023, Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade.

#### **Scrutiny Liaison Committee – appointment of President**

THE STATES, in accordance with Standing Order 121(1), appointed the President of the Scrutiny Liaison Committee as follows –

Deputy Inna Gardiner of St. Helier North was nominated by Deputy Louise Mary Catherine Doublet of St. Saviour

Deputy Catherine Dolores Curtis of St. Helier Central was nominated by Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade.

In accordance with Standing Order 121(3), each candidate made a speech and was questioned prior to a recorded vote being taken.

THE STATES, having proceeded to an open ballot, were informed of the following result by the Deputy Bailiff –

Deputy I. Gardiner of Deputy C.D. Curtis of Abstain: 3

St. Helier North: 25 St. Helier Central: 16

Connétable of St. John	Connétable of St. Lawrence	Connétable of St. Martin
Connétable of St. Clement	Connétable of Trinity	Deputy S.G. Luce
Connétable of St. Mary	Connétable of St. Peter	Deputy L.J. Farnham
Connétable of St. Saviour	Connétable of Grouville	
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet	Connétable of St. Ouen	
Deputy K.F. Morel	Deputy G.P. Southern	
Deputy S.M. Ahier	Deputy M. Tadier	
Deputy I. Gardiner	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat	
Deputy I.J. Gorst	Deputy R.J. Ward	
Deputy K.L. Moore	Deputy C.S. Alves	
Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache	Deputy S.Y. Mézec	
Deputy D.J. Warr	Deputy T.A. Coles	
Deputy H.M. Miles	Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée	
Deputy J. Renouf	Deputy C.D. Curtis	
Deputy R.E. Binet	Deputy L.V. Feltham	
Deputy H.L. Jeune	Deputy R.S. Kovacs	
Deputy M.E. Millar		
Deputy A. Howell		

The Deputy Bailiff accordingly declared that Deputy Inna Gardiner of St. Helier North had been duly elected as President of the Scrutiny Liaison Committee.

#### Privileges and Procedures Committee – appointment of members

In accordance with Standing Order 122(1), the following nominations were made by the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee as members of the Committee who were not Ministers or Assistant Ministers –

Deputy Stephen Morrison Ahier of St. Helier North

Deputy T.J.A. Binet
Deputy M.R. Ferey
Deputy A.F. Curtis
Deputy B. Ward
Deputy K.M. Wilson
Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson
Deputy M.B. Andrews

Deputy Thomas Anthony Coles of St. Helier South

Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter.

Deputy Jonathan Renouf of St. Brelade was nominated by Deputy Helen Mary Miles of St. Brelade. Deputy Karen Margaret Wilson of St. Clement was nominated by Deputy Louise Mary Catherine Doublet of St. Saviour.

THE STATES, having proceeded to a secret ballot, were informed of the following results by the Deputy Bailiff –

Deputy Stephen Morrison Ahier of St. Helier North	27
Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter	25
Deputy Thomas Anthony Coles of St. Helier South	23
Deputy Jonathan Renouf of St. Brelade	21
Deputy Karen Margaret Wilson of St. Clement	18

The Deputy Bailiff accordingly declared that the following had been duly appointed as members of the Privileges and Procedures Committee –

Deputy Stephen Morrison Ahier of St. Helier North

Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter

Deputy Thomas Anthony Coles of St. Helier South.

The following nominations were made by the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee as members of the Committee who were Ministers or Assistant Ministers –

The Connétable of St. Brelade

Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central.

There being no other nominations, the Deputy Bailiff accordingly declared that the Connétable of St. Brelade and Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central had been duly appointed as members of the Privileges and Procedures Committee.

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, agreed to defer appointment of a member of the Privileges and Procedures Committee who was a member of the Scrutiny Liaison Committee to the meeting of 19th March 2024.

## **Public Accounts Committee – appointment of elected members**

In accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 123(1), the following nominations were made by Deputy Inna Gardiner of St. Helier North, Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, as the elected members of the Committee –

Deputy Raluca Stefana Kovacs of St. Saviour

Deputy Karen Margaret Wilson of St. Clement.

There being no other nominations, the Deputy Bailiff declared that Deputy Raluca Stefana Kovacs of St. Saviour and Deputy Karen Margaret Wilson of St. Clement had been duly appointed as members of the Public Accounts Committee.

#### **Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel – appointment of members**

In accordance with Standing Order 125(1) the Chair of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel indicated that she wished to have a Panel of 6 members, including the chair, and nominated the following as members of the Panel –

The Connétable of St. Mary

Deputy Jonathan Renouf of St. Brelade Deputy

Deputy Alexander Frederick Curtis of St. Clement

Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter

Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that the Connétable of St. Mary, Deputy Jonathan Renouf of St. Brelade, Deputy Alexander Frederick Curtis of St. Clement, Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter and Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North had been duly appointed as members of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.

## Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel – appointment of members

In accordance with Standing Order 125(1) the Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel indicated that he wished to have a Panel of 4 members, including the chair, and nominated the following as members of the Panel –

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier Central

Deputy Karen Margaret Wilson of St. Clement

Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier Central, Deputy Karen Margaret Wilson of St. Clement and Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North had been duly appointed as members of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel.

## Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel – appointment of members

In accordance with Standing Order 125(1) the Chair of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel indicated that she wished to have a Panel of 5 members, including the chair, and nominated the following as members of the Panel –

The Connétable of St. Mary

Deputy Thomas Antony Coles of St. Helier South

Deputy David James Warr of St. Helier South

Deputy Alexander Frederick Curtis of St. Clement.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that the Connétable of St. Mary, Deputy Thomas Antony Coles of St. Helier South, Deputy David James Warr of St. Helier South and Deputy Alexander Frederick Curtis of St. Clement had been duly appointed as members of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel.

## Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel – appointment of members

In accordance with Standing Order 125(1) the Chair of the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel indicated that she wished to have a Panel of 4 members, including the chair, and nominated the following as members of the Panel –

Deputy Sir Philip Martin Bailhache of St. Clement

Deputy Jonathan Renouf of St. Brelade

Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that Deputy Sir Philip Martin Bailhache of St. Clement, Deputy Jonathan Renouf of St. Brelade and Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter had been duly appointed as members of the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel.

## Planning Committee – appointment of members

In accordance with Standing Order 125A the Chair of the Planning Committee indicated that he wished to have a Committee of 10 members, including the Chair, and nominated the following as members of the Committee –

The Connétable of Grouville

Deputy Stephen Morrison Ahier of St. Helier North.

Deputy Kristina Louise Moore of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter was nominated by Deputy Inna Gardiner of St. Helier North.

Deputy Hiliary Louise Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity was nominated by Deputy Kristina Louise Moore of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter

THE STATES, having proceeded to a secret ballot, were informed of the following results by the Deputy Bailiff –

Deputy Stephen Morrison Ahier of St. Helier North	30
The Connétable of Grouville	21
Deputy Kristina Louise Moore of St. May, St. Ouen and St. Peter	16
Deputy Hiliary Louise Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity	13

The Deputy Bailiff accordingly declared that the Connétable of Grouville and Deputy Stephen Morrison Ahier of St. Helier North had been duly appointed as Member of the Planning Committee.

## British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly – appointment of member and associate member

THE STATES commenced consideration of the nomination and election of an associate member to represent the States of Jersey on the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly.

Deputy Hiliary Louise Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity was nominated by the Connétable of St. John

Deputy Thomas Antony Coles of St. Helier South was nominated by Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier Central.

THE STATES, having proceeded to a secret ballot, were informed of the following results by the Deputy Bailiff –

Deputy Hiliary Louise Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity	24
Deputy Thomas Antony Coles of St. Helier South	19

The Deputy Bailiff accordingly declared that Deputy Hiliary Louise Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity had been duly appointed as the associate member to represent the States of Jersey on the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly.

## **Written Questions**

(see Official Report/Hansard)

- WQ.4/2024 1. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 29th January 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding vacancies in the Cabinet Office.
- WQ.7/2024 2. The Minister for Housing and Communities had tabled an answer on 12th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding rental stabilisation measures.
- WQ.8/2024 3. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 12th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North regarding the budget allocated to post-16 education.
- WQ.9/2024 4. The Minister for the Environment had tabled an answer on 12th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy J. Renouf of St. Brelade regarding the Climate Emergency Fund's income.

WQ.10/2024 5. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 12th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy H.L. Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity regarding the funding currently allocated to skills development.

- WQ.11/2024 6. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding the implementation of changes to the Cabinet Office.
- WQ.12/2024 7. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy H.L. Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity regarding the funding allocated for Early Years in the Government Plan 2024-2027.
- WQ.13/2024 8. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy H.L. Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity regarding the Government procurement process.
- WQ.14/2024 9. The Minister for Treasury and Resources had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding the transfer of funds from the Consolidated Fund to the Strategic Reserve or the Stabilisation Fund.
- WQ.15/2024 10. The Minister for Justice and Home Affairs had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding cases involving child abuse.
- WQ.16/2024 11. The Minister for Justice and Home Affairs had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding Portuguese as a language option in the curriculum.
- WQ.17/2024 12. The Minister for the Environment had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy T.A. Coles of St. Helier South regarding the number of employees and vacancies within the Planning Department.
- WQ.18/2024 13. The Minister for Health and Social Services had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy T.A. Coles of St. Helier South regarding misdiagnoses within Health and Community Services.
- WQ.19/2024 14. The Minister for Infrastructure had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy C.D. Curtis of St. Helier Central regarding reinstating the re-use centre at La Collette.
- WQ.20/2024

  15. The Minister for the Environment had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy C.D. Curtis of St. Helier Central regarding Regulations under the Food (Jersey) Law 2023.
- WQ.21/2024 16. The Minister for the Environment had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy J. Renouf of St. Brelade regarding a new Island Plan.
- WQ.22/2024 17. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North regarding skills gaps identified and evidenced by Skills Jersey.
- WQ.23/2024 18. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North regarding apprenticeships.

WQ.24/2024 19. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North regarding the subsidy for apprenticeships.

- WQ.25/2024 20. The Minister for Infrastructure had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy D.J. Warr of St. Helier South regarding negotiations for the purchase of the Gas Works site.
- WQ.26/2024 21. The Minister for Housing and Communities had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy D.J. Warr of St. Helier South regarding the vacant homes at the Haut du Mont site.
- WQ.27/2024 22. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy D.J. Warr of St. Helier South regarding the report on Jersey's housing market.
- WQ.28/2024 23. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 19th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding Portuguese speakers in Jersey.
- WQ.29/2024 24. The Minister for Health and Social Services had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central regarding the Health Access Scheme.
- WQ.30/2024 25. The Minister for Health and Social Services had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central regarding the Medicines Optimisation Committee.
- WQ.31/2024 26. The Minister for Social Security had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central regarding the high-level review of benefits completed in 2023.
- WQ.32/2024 27. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding remuneration for Consultants.
- WQ.33/2024 28. The Chair of the States Employment Board had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding staff currently employed in the Health and Community Services Department.
- WQ.34/2024 29. The Minister for Justice and Home Affairs had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North regarding deaths by suicide.
- WQ.35/2024 30. The Minister for Health and Social Services had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour regarding the assisted dying legislation.
- WQ.36/2024 31. The Minister for Justice and Home Affairs had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour regarding recommendations in the Violence Against Women and Girls (VAWG) report.
- WQ.37/2024 32. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North regarding student finance support.
- WQ.38/2024 33. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North regarding student funding applications.

WQ.39/2024 34. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North regarding the total annual budget for Hautlieu School.

- WQ.40/2024 35. The Minister for the Environment had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy J. Renouf of St. Brelade regarding the Bridging Island Plan.
- WQ.41/2024 36. The Chief Minister had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy J. Renouf of St. Brelade regarding the Future Places Ministerial Group.
- WQ.42/2024 37. The Minister for Treasury and Resources had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter regarding the total amount of goods and services tax (GST) that was collected on the personal importation of items classed as medical goods in 2023.
- WQ.43/2024 38. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter regarding spending on sport and physical activity.
- WQ.44/2024 39. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter regarding PE teachers employed in Jersey.
- WQ.45/2024 40. The Minister for Infrastructure had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy K.M. Wilson of St. Clement regarding the refurbishment of Clinique Pinel.
- WQ.46/2024 41. The Minister for Infrastructure had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy K.M. Wilson of St. Clement regarding the capital programme included in the Government Plan 2024-2027.
- WQ.47/2024 42. The Minister for Sustainable Economic Development had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding the new sound and lighting system for the Opera House.
- WQ.48/2024 43. The Minister for Infrastructure had tabled an answer on 26th February 2024 to a question asked by Deputy K.M. Wilson of St. Clement regarding the results of the survey into the condition of Government-owned properties.

## **Oral Questions**

(see Official Report/Hansard)

- OQ.30/2024 1. Deputy D.J. Warr of St. Helier South asked a question of the Minister for Housing and Communities regarding the protection for tenants in residential legislation.
- OQ.35/2024 2. Deputy J. Renouf of St. Brelade asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding plans for bringing forward a new Common Strategic Policy.
- OQ.31/2024 3. Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North asked a question of the Minister for International Development regarding support for displaced persons from the conflict in Gaza.
- OQ.29/2024 4. Deputy K.M. Wilson of St. Clement asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding a reduction in the costs associated with employing locum and agency staff.
- OQ.33/2024 5. Deputy L.K.F Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the Government's position on building a sustainable population.

OQ.37/2024 6. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding clinical decisions made within his Department.

- OQ.36/2024 7. Deputy D.J. Warr of St. Helier South asked a question to the Chair of the Comité des Connétables regarding a review of the Rates (Jersey) Law 2005.
- OQ.38/2024 8. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding a review of the High Value Resident (HVR) taxation regime.
- OQ.32/2024 9. Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding reform of the public sector.
- OQ.34/2024 10. Deputy L.K.F Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding properties or areas of significant value to the people of Jersey.

#### **Oral Questions without notice**

(see Official Report/Hansard)

The Minister for Justice and Home Affairs answered questions without notice from members.

The Minister for International Development answered questions without notice from members.

The Chief Minister answered questions without notice from members.

## **Changes in Presidency**

The Deputy Bailiff retired from the Chamber during the period of Oral Questions without Notice to the Minister for Justice and Home Affairs and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mrs Lisa-Marie Hart, Greffier of the States, until the end of the period of Oral Questions without Notice to the Chief Minister.

THE STATES re-assembled after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff.

## Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Minister for External Relations, agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of his amendment (P.7/2024 Amd.Amd.) to his amendment (P.7/2024 Amd.) to the proposition of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade entitled 'Ceasefire in Gaza' (P.7/2024) in order that it might be debated at the present meeting.

POUR: 41 CONTRE: 0 ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Helier

Connétable of St. Lawrence

Connétable of Trinity

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Martin

Connétable of St. John

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Mary

Connétable of St. Saviour

Deputy G.P. Southern

Deputy C.F. Labey

Deputy M. Tadier

Deputy S.G. Luce

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat

Deputy S.M. Ahier

Deputy R.J. Ward

Deputy C.S. Alves

Deputy I. Gardiner

Deputy I.J. Gorst

Deputy L.J. Farnham

Deputy S.Y. Mézec

Deputy T.A. Coles

Deputy D.J. Warr

Deputy H.M. Miles

Deputy J. Renouf

Deputy C.D. Curtis

Deputy L.V. Feltham

Deputy R.E. Binet

Deputy M.E. Millar

Deputy A. Howell

Deputy T.J.A. Binet

Deputy M.R. Ferey

Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy A.F. Curtis

Deputy B. Ward

Deputy K.M. Wilson

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy M.B. Andrews

#### Ceasefire in Gaza P.7/2024

THE STATES, commencing consideration of a proposition of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade entitled 'Ceasefire in Gaza' (P.7/2024), commenced consideration of an amendment of the Minister for External Relations (P.7/2024 Amd.) and, adopting an amendment of the Minister for External Relations (P.7/2024 Amd.Amd.), agreed that, in paragraph (e), the words "two-state" should be deleted.

THE STATES, adopting the first part of the amendment of the Minister for External Relations, agreed that, in paragraph (a), for the words "the loss of civilian lives" there should be substituted "death and harm to civilians"; and that, after the word "especially", there should be inserted the words "women and".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 45 CONTRE: 0 ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Helier

Connétable of St. Lawrence

Connétable of Trinity

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Martin

Connétable of St. John

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Mary

Connétable of St. Saviour

Deputy G.P. Southern

Deputy C.F. Labey

Deputy M. Tadier

Deputy S.G. Luce

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet

Deputy K.F. Morel

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat

Deputy S.M. Ahier

Deputy R.J. Ward

Deputy C.S. Alves

Deputy I. Gardiner

Deputy I.J. Gorst

Deputy L.J. Farnham

Deputy K.L. Moore

Deputy S.Y. Mézec

Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache

Deputy T.A. Coles

Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée

Deputy D.J. Warr

Deputy H.M. Miles

Deputy J. Renouf

Deputy C.D. Curtis

Deputy L.V. Feltham

Deputy R.E. Binet

Deputy M.E. Millar

Deputy A. Howell

Deputy T.J.A. Binet

Deputy M.R. Ferey

Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy A.F. Curtis

Deputy B. Ward

Deputy K.M. Wilson

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES, adopting the second part of the amendment of the Minister for External Relations, agreed that, in paragraph (b), for the words "a permanent ceasefire", there should be substituted "an immediate suspension of hostilities" and that, for the words "and that all hostages and those held under unlawful detention should be released", there should be substituted "to enable the unconditional release of hostages and those held under unlawful detention, the urgent provision of humanitarian assistance, and a permanent ceasefire".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 35 CONTRE: 10 ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Connétable of Trinity
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Martin
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. John
Deputy M. Tadier
Deputy R.J. Ward
Deputy C.S. Alves
Deputy S.Y. Mézec
Deputy T.A. Coles

Connétable of Grouville Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée

Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Mary Connétable of St. Saviour Deputy G.P. Southern Deputy C.F. Labey Deputy S.G. Luce Deputy L.M.C. Doublet Deputy K.F. Morel

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat

Deputy S.M. Ahier Deputy I. Gardiner Deputy I.J. Gorst Deputy L.J. Farnham Deputy K.L. Moore

Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache

Deputy D.J. Warr Deputy H.M. Miles Deputy J. Renouf Deputy R.E. Binet Deputy M.E. Millar Deputy A. Howell Deputy T.J.A. Binet Deputy M.R. Ferey Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy B. Ward Deputy K.M. Wilson

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy M.B. Andrews

Deputy C.D. Curtis Deputy L.V. Feltham Deputy A.F. Curtis

THE STATES, adopting the third part of the amendment of the Minister for External Relations, agreed that, in paragraph (c), for the words "stop further significant loss of civilian lives and to avoid potential acts of genocide" there should be substituted "prevent death and harm to civilians and damage to civilian infrastructure on a mass scale".

Members present voted as follows –

**CONTRE: 19 POUR: 26 ABSTAIN: 0** 

Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Mary Connétable of St. Saviour Deputy C.F. Labey Deputy S.G. Luce Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat

Deputy S.M. Ahier

Deputy I. Gardiner Deputy I.J. Gorst Deputy L.J. Farnham Deputy K.L. Moore Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache

Deputy D.J. Warr

Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. John Deputy G.P. Southern Deputy M. Tadier Deputy L.M.C. Doublet Deputy K.F. Morel Deputy R.J. Ward Deputy C.S. Alves Deputy S.Y. Mézec Deputy T.A. Coles

Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée

Deputy J. Renouf Deputy C.D. Curtis Deputy L.V. Feltham Deputy R.S. Kovacs Deputy A.F. Curtis

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy H.M. Miles

Deputy R.E. Binet Deputy M.E. Millar

Deputy A. Howell

Deputy T.J.A. Binet

Deputy M.R. Ferey

Deputy B. Ward

Deputy K.M. Wilson

Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES, adopting the fourth part of the amendment of the Minister for External Relations, agreed that, in paragraph (d), for the words "interim ruling" there should be substituted "independence and work"; for the words "in South Africa's case against Israel" there should be substituted ", including in relation to the conflict in Gaza,", and after the words "should be respected", "having particular regard to the court's interim ruling" should be inserted.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 26 CONTRE: 19 ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Helier

Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of Trinity

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Mary

Connétable of St. Saviour

Deputy C.F. Labey

Deputy S.G. Luce

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat

Deputy I. Gardiner

Deputy I.J. Gorst

Deputy L.J. Farnham Deputy K.L. Moore

Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache

Deputy D.J. Warr

Deputy H.M. Miles

Deputy J. Renouf

Deputy R.E. Binet

Deputy M.E. Millar

Deputy A. Howell

Deputy T.J.A. Binet

Deputy M.R. Ferey

Deputy B. Ward

Deputy K.M. Wilson

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. John Deputy G.P. Southern Deputy M. Tadier

Deputy K.F. Morel Deputy S.M. Ahier

Deputy R.J. Ward

Deputy C.S. Alves

Deputy S.Y. Mézec Deputy T.A. Coles

Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée

Deputy C.D. Curtis

Deputy L.V. Feltham

Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy A.F. Curtis

Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES, adopting the fifth part of the amendment of the Minister for External Relations, as amended, agreed that, in paragraph (e), for the words "solution to end the conflict" there should be substituted "resolution to the conflict is vital"; the words "including an immediate end to the military occupation of the Palestinian Territories, should be pursued by the U.K. Government and its allies" should be deleted; and, after the words "lasting peace in the region", there should be inserted ", based on a solution which provides justice, freedom from occupation, and security for both Israelis and Palestinians".

Connétable of St. Martin

Connétable of St. John

Deputy G.P. Southern

Deputy M. Tadier

Members present voted as follows -

#### POUR: 31 CONTRE: 14 ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Mary Connétable of St. Saviour Deputy C.F. Labey Deputy S.G. Luce Deputy L.M.C. Doublet Deputy K.F. Morel Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat Deputy S.M. Ahier Deputy I. Gardiner Deputy I.J. Gorst

Deputy R.J. Ward
Deputy C.S. Alves
Deputy S.Y. Mézec
Deputy T.A. Coles
Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée
Deputy C.D. Curtis
Deputy L.V. Feltham
Deputy R.S. Kovacs
Deputy A.F. Curtis
Deputy M.B. Andrews

Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache Deputy D.J. Warr Deputy H.M. Miles Deputy J. Renouf Deputy R.E. Binet Deputy M.E. Millar Deputy A. Howell Deputy T.J.A. Binet Deputy M.R. Ferey Deputy B. Ward Deputy K.M. Wilson Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy L.J. Farnham Deputy K.L. Moore

THE STATES rejected the sixth part of the amendment by the Minister for External Relations that, in paragraph (f), for the words "express the view of" there should be substituted "updates"; for the word "on" there should be substituted "over the steps taken by Ministers to raise"; and that, after the word "matter", for the word "to" there should be substituted "with".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 15 CONTRE: 30 ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of St. Saviour Deputy S.G. Luce Deputy I. Gardiner Deputy I.J. Gorst Deputy L.J. Farnham Deputy K.L. Moore Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache Deputy D.J. Warr Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. John Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. Ouen Connétable of St. Mary Deputy G.P. Southern Deputy C.F. Labey Deputy M. Tadier Deputy L.M.C. Doublet

Deputy M.E. Millar Deputy M.R. Ferey Deputy B. Ward Deputy K.M. Wilson Deputy K.F. Morel Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat Deputy S.M. Ahier Deputy R.J. Ward

Deputy C.S. Alves Deputy S.Y. Mézec Deputy T.A. Coles

Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée

Deputy H.M. Miles
Deputy J. Renouf
Deputy C.D. Curtis
Deputy L.V. Feltham
Deputy R.E. Binet
Deputy A. Howell
Deputy T.J.A. Binet
Deputy R.S. Kovacs
Deputy A.F. Curtis
Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES, adopting the proposition of Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade, as amended –

(a) expressed their profound sadness and dismay at the extent of loss of civilian lives in Gaza and Israel and condemned the taking of hostages and all acts of aggression which violated international law and resulted in death and harm to civilians, especially women and children;

- (b) agreed that an immediate suspension of hostilities should be established to enable the unconditional release of hostages and those held under unlawful detention, the urgent provision of humanitarian assistance, and a permanent ceasefire;
- (c) agreed that international law should be adhered to in order to prevent death and harm to civilians and damage to civilian infrastructure on a mass scale;
- (d) agreed that the independence and work of the International Court of Justice, including in relation to the conflict in Gaza should be respected having regard to the court's interim ruling;
- (e) agreed that a diplomatic resolution to the conflict was vital, in order to secure stability and a lasting peace in the region, based on a solution which provided justice, freedom from occupation, and security for both Israelis and Palestinians; and
- (f) requested that the Government of Jersey express the view of the Assembly on this matter to the UK Government.

Members present voted as follows -

POUR: 45 CONTRE: 0 ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Helier Connétable of St. Lawrence Connétable of Trinity Connétable of St. Peter Connétable of St. Martin Connétable of St. John Connétable of St. Clement Connétable of Grouville Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Mary

Connétable of St. Saviour

Deputy G.P. Southern

Deputy C.F. Labey

Deputy M. Tadier

Deputy S.G. Luce

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet

Deputy K.F. Morel

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat

Deputy S.M. Ahier

Deputy R.J. Ward

Deputy C.S. Alves

Deputy I. Gardiner

Deputy I.J. Gorst

Deputy L.J. Farnham

Deputy K.L. Moore

Deputy S.Y. Mézec

Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache

Deputy T.A. Coles

Deputy B.B. de S.V.M. Porée

Deputy D.J. Warr

Deputy H.M. Miles

Deputy J. Renouf

Deputy C.D. Curtis

Deputy L.V. Feltham

Deputy R.E. Binet

Deputy M.E. Millar

Deputy A. Howell

Deputy T.J.A. Binet

Deputy M.R. Ferey

Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy A.F. Curtis

Deputy B. Ward

Deputy K.M. Wilson

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy M.B. Andrews

## Jersey Overseas Aid: re-appointment of a Commissioner P.4/2024

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Minister for International Development entitled 'Jersey Overseas Aid: re-appointment of a Commissioner' (P.4/2024), re-appointed, in accordance with the Jersey Overseas Aid Commission (Jersey) Law 2005, Mr. Alistair Calvert as a non-States Commissioner of the Jersey Overseas Aid Commission, effective from 20th March 2024 until 20th March 2027.

## Cabinet Office expenditure savings P.8/2024

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Deputy Max Brennan Andrews of St. Helier North entitled 'Cabinet Office expenditure savings' (P.8/2024) and, adopting the proposition, requested the Chief Minister to review the revenue expenditure of the Cabinet Office and ensure that expenditure savings were identified and included within the Government Plan 2025-2028.

Deputy A.F. Curtis

Members present voted as follows -

POUR: 38 CONTRE: 0 ABSTAIN: 1

Connétable of St. Helier

Connétable of St. Lawrence

Connétable of Trinity

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Martin

Connétable of St. John

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Mary

Connétable of St. Saviour

Deputy G.P. Southern

Deputy S.G. Luce

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat

Deputy S.M. Ahier

Deputy R.J. Ward

Deputy C.S. Alves

Deputy I. Gardiner

Deputy I.J. Gorst

Deputy L.J. Farnham

Deputy K.L. Moore

Deputy S.Y. Mézec

Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache

Deputy T.A. Coles

Deputy D.J. Warr

Deputy J. Renouf

Deputy C.D. Curtis

Deputy L.V. Feltham

Deputy R.E. Binet

Deputy M.E. Millar

Deputy A. Howell

Deputy M.R. Ferey

Deputy R.S. Kovacs

Deputy B. Ward

Deputy K.M. Wilson

Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

Deputy M.B. Andrews

# Arrangement of public business for future meetings

THE STATES agreed the following arrangement of public business for future meetings proposed, as amended, by the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 88(3) –

## 19th March 2024

Scrutiny Panel constitution: Minimum size.

P.94/2023.

Lodged: 7th November 2023, Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North.

Appointment of Non-Executive Directors and new Chair to the States of Jersey Development Company.  Lodged: 10th November 2023, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	P.95/2023. (re-issue).
Protection of Trees. Lodged: 27th November 2023, <i>Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade</i> .	P.98/2023.
Draft Children and Civil Status (Amendments) (Jersey) Law 202 Lodged: 21st December 2023, <i>Minister for Children and Education</i> .	P.104/2023.
Draft Children and Young People (Jersey) Commencement Act 202 Lodged: 12th January 2024, <i>Minister for Children and Education</i> .	P.2/2024.
Cash payment at Government Sports facilities. Lodged: 26th February 2024, <i>Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter</i> .	P.10/2024.
Cash payment at Government Sports facilities (P.10/2024) – Children's Rights Impact Assessment.  Presented: 26th February 2024, <i>Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter.</i>	P.10/2024. Add.
Update of Higher Education Student Funding. Lodged: 26th February 2024, <i>Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North</i> .	P.12/2024.
Update of Higher Education Student Funding (P.12/2024) – Children's Rights Impact Assessment.  Presented: 26th February 2024, <i>Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier North</i> .	P.12/2024. Add.
16th April 2024	
Offshore Wind. Lodged: 17th October 2023, <i>Council of Ministers</i> .	P.82/2023.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202 Lodged: 16th January 2024, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	P.6/2024.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-(P.6/2024): Children's Rights Impact Assessment.  Presented: 16th January 2024, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	P.6/2024. Add.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-(P.6/2024): amendment. Lodged: 13th February 2024, <i>Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour</i> .	P.6/2024. Amd.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-(P.6/2024): amendment. (P.6/2024 Amd.): Children's Rights Impact Assessment. Presented: 13th February 2024, <i>Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour</i> .	P.6/2024. Amd.Add.
Comptroller and Auditor General Board of Governance: Appointment of Member. Lodged: 23rd February 2024, <i>Chief Minister</i> .	P.9/2024.
Andium Homes Limited: Articles of Association. Lodged: 26th February 2024, Minister for Treasury and Resources.	P.11/2024.

THE STATES rose at 5:36 p.m.

L.-M. HART

Greffier of the States